## Audit Procedures for Convenience Stores

## Table of Contents

Chapter I - Introduction ..... 1
Introduction ..... 1
Chapter II - What is Taxable at Convenience Stores? ..... 2
Examples of Taxable Items ..... 2
Food Sold for Immediate Consumption ..... 4
Cigarettes and Tobacco Products ..... 4
Newspapers ..... 4
Phone Cards ..... 5
Over-the-Counter Drugs and Medicines ..... 5
Chapter III - Methods of Tax Determination ..... 6
Cash Register Keys ..... 6
Computer-Generated Sales Registers ..... 6
Retail Inventory Method ..... 7
Gross Profit Method ..... 7
Chapter IV - Miscellaneous Taxpayer Store Topics ..... 10
5 Percent Audit Allowance ..... 10
Actual Substantiated Losses ..... 11
Penalty and Interest Application ..... 11
Allowance for Bad Debts ..... 11
Consignment and Commission Sales ..... 12
Coupons and Premiums ..... 12
Vending Machine Sales ..... 13
Items Purchased by Customers with Food Stamps/Lone Star Card ..... 13
Combination Grocery and Snack Bar or Delicatessen ..... 14
Items Withdrawn from Inventory for Use ..... 15
Wrapping and Packaging Supplies ..... 15
Chapter V - Auditing Procedures ..... 16
Purchase Ratio Method ..... 16
Markup Methods ..... 21
Lack of Records ..... 28
Beer, Wine and Tobacco Vendor Data ..... 32
Alternative Markup Factors (when all records are not available) ..... 33
Chapter VI - Convenience Store Audit Checklist ..... 40
Gross Sales ..... 40
Taxable Sales ..... 40
Selection of Test Periods ..... 41
Examination of Records ..... 41
Sampling/Estimation Issues ..... 42

## Chapter I Introduction

## Introduction

This procedure manual has been written for the auditor. It is to be used as a training tool and reference guide. When forms are used as exhibits, they are shown with information correctly completed. Any schedules included in the manual are for illustration purposes only and are not to be construed as the accepted format. Audit schedules will need to be tailored to the audit situations encountered and to the auditors' needs.

Users of this manual are responsible for any changes that occur after its printing or posting. References to taxability of individual items, administrative policies, or tax law and rules are provided for the guidance of field auditors and are subject to change due to administrative hearings and actions of courts or the Legislature.

Before relying on this information, all users should verify the current status of any information by contacting the Comptroller of Public Accounts. Call toll free statewide at 800-252-5555; in Austin, the number is 512-463-4600.

## Chapter II <br> What is Taxable at Convenience Stores?

- Examples of Taxable Items
- Food Sold for Immediate Consumption
- Cigarettes and Tobacco Products
- Newspapers
- Phone Cards
- Over-the-Counter Drugs and Medicines

A good place to begin is to list some examples of items that would be subject to the limited sales and use tax. Keep in mind that this only lists examples of items, and is not all-inclusive. Some items will be footnoted and explained further. In addition, some items not listed will be addressed separately.

## Examples of Taxable Items

Adhesive tape
Ale
Ammunition
Automotive transmission fluid
**Baby care products (oil, lotion, etc.)
Batteries
Beer
Breath mints
Brushes
*Candy
Charcoal
Christmas trees
Cigarette lighters
Coffee pots
Cosmetics
Dental floss
Deodorants
Diapers
Disinfectants
Fabric softeners
Fishing tackle
Floor wax
*Frozen drinks
Garden supplies

Aluminum foil
Ammonia
Automotive oil
Automotive antifreeze
Bags (all types)
Beauty supplies
Bleach
Brooms
Candles
Cards
Charcoal lighter fluid
Cigarettes
Clothing
Cologne
**Cough drops
Detergents
Deodorizers
*Diluted fruit juices
Electrical supplies
Fertilizer
Firearms
Freezer paper and tape
Garbage bags
Gift wrap

| Gum | Hair conditioner |
| :---: | :---: |
| **Hair shampoo | Hair spray |
| Hair coloring | Hardware items |
| Houseware items | Ice |
| Ice chests | Ice cream salt |
| ***Ice cream sundries | Insecticides |
| Keys (including duplication) | Light bulbs |
| Liquor | **Lotions |
| Matches | Magazines |
| Mops | Mop replacement heads/handles |
| Mothballs | Nails |
| *Nuts (candy-coated) | Pencils and pens |
| Perfume | Pet food |
| Popsicles | *Powdered drinks |
| Razors and blades | Sandwiches (except frozen) |
| Sandwich bags | School supplies |
| Scouring pads | Shaving cream/after shave |
| Shoelaces | *Soft drinks |
| Sponges | Starch |
| Stationery and cards | Tape |
| Thread | Toilet tissue |
| Toothbrushes | Toothpaste |
| Toothpicks | Toys |
| Tobacco products | Towels |
| Water softener salt | Wax removers |
| Wine (except cooking wine) | Water - when flavored |
| Exempt if purchased with food stamps or the Lone Star Card |  |
| ** Exempt if medicated |  |
| *** Exempt if sold in pa |  |

Effective Oct. 1, 2003, fruit drinks containing more than 50 percent juice are exempt as food products

Effective October 1, 2003, retailers who mix two or more food ingredients for sale by weight or volume (e.g., salad) as a single item must collect sales tax unless the mixture has raw animal foods (eggs, fish, meat or poultry) that require cooking by the consumer per U.S. Food and Drug Administration (FDA) recommendations. The provision does not include bakery items and food that is only cut, repackaged or pasteurized.

Effective June 18, 2012, sunscreen is once again exempt from Texas sales and use tax. Legislation that became effective on Sept. 1, 2007 amended the definition of OTC drugs in Texas Tax Code Section 151.313 (a)(3) to provide that an over-the-counter item is exempt from sales tax only if the OTC drug or medicine is REQUIRED by the FDA to be labeled with a drug facts panel. As a result of that statutory change, sunscreen became taxable because it was not required to be labeled with a drug facts panel. Because sunscreen is now REQUIRED by the FDA to be labeled with a drug facts panel, it also now qualifies for the exemption set out in Tax Code Section 151.313 (a)(3). Therefore, as of June 18, 2012, sunscreen is once again exempt from Texas sales and use tax. So, from September 1, 2007 through June 17, 2012, sunscreen is taxable, but non-taxable thereafter.

Effective September 1, 2013: Snack items are now defined under 151.314(b) as a "food product." Snack items include:

- breakfast bars, granola bars, nutrition bars, sports bars, protein bars or yogurt bars, unless labeled and marketed as candy;
- snack mix or trail mix;
- nuts, unless candy-coated;
- popcorn; and
- chips, crackers or hard pretzels.

Snack items sold through a vending machine or in individual portions are taxable. An individual-sized portion is a portion that:

- is labeled as having not more than one serving; or
- contains less than 2.5 ounces, if the package does not specify the number of servings.


## Food Sold for Immediate Consumption

Tax must be collected on:

- all food kept and sold hot, such as barbecued beef, chicken, chili, soups, barbacoa, tamales, tacos, etc.;
- all individual-sized portions of food sold with utensils, such as plates, knives, forks, spoons; and
- if there is a bakery, coffee shop or deli with a place to sit and eat, tax must be collected on items sold "through the restaurant" including the items listed above and all food items, when sold in individualsized containers, which are ready to eat, such as chips, cookies, crackers, peanuts, etc.

Prior to October 1, 2003, all individual-size bakery products such as doughnuts and cookies, when sold in quantities of five or less by a retailer that provided eating facilities, were considered to be for immediate consumption and thus subject to sales tax.

## Cigarettes and Tobacco Products

Even though cigarettes and tobacco products are taxed under different statutes, they are also subject to the limited sales and use tax.

## Newspapers

Newspapers are not taxable. The State Sales and Use Tax Statute Sec. 151.319 (f) defines a newspaper as publications:

- printed on newsprint;
- distributed at intervals of four weeks or less;
- sold for an average price-per-copy of $\$ 1.50$ cents or less over a 30-day period through August 31, 2013. Effective September 1, 2013, the average price increased to $\$ 3.00$ or less over a 30 -day period; and
- for the dissemination of news of a general character and of general interest, including advertising.

NOTE: Publications distributed free of charge that meet the above criteria would also qualify as newspapers.

## Phone Cards

Tax must be collected on the sale of all pre-paid phone cards. Prepaid calling cards became taxable as tangible personal property effective September 1, 1997, per 151.01032 of the Sales and Use Tax Law for the definition of "calling card" and per 151.009 for its inclusion as taxable tangible personal property.

For more information on items on which the grocer must collect sales tax, consult Publication \# TX 96-280 - What is Taxable at Grocery and Convenience Stores.

## Over-the-Counter Drugs and Medicines

Effective April 1, 2000, over-the-counter (OTC) drugs and medicines are exempt from sales tax.
To qualify for the exemption, a product must be applied to, ingested by or inhaled by humans. In addition, the drug or medicine must be intended or marketed for the use in the diagnosis, cure, mitigation, treatment, or prevention of disease, illness, injury or pain. The over-the-counter drug or medicine must have a National Drug Code (NDC) number, but the number does not have to appear on the product label in order to be exempt.

Items for animals are not exempt unless purchased with a veterinarian's prescription.

To give the auditor an idea as to which products qualify for the exemption, the following is a short list of qualifying products. Again, the products listed below merely serve as a guideline.

Acne treatment products
Analgesics
Anti-asthmatic products
Anti-fungal products
Antibiotics
Anti-rheumatic products
Cough suppressants
Dietary supplements/vitamins
Expectorants
Hemorrhoid products
Pain relievers (aspirin, ibuprofen, etc.)
Stimulants
Sunburn treatment products

Allergy treatment products
Antacids
Anti-diarrhea products
Anti-nausea products
Antiperspirants
Cold remedies
Dandruff shampoos
Ear care products
*Eye care/contact lens products
Laxatives
Sedatives/sleep aids
Sunburn prevention products
Wound care dressings

* Must be applied to the eye - exemption does not apply if product is merely used to clean the contact lens.

There could be a fine line between a qualifying product and a non-qualifying product. For example, deodorants are subject to sales tax but antiperspirants are exempt. For more information on over-the-counter drugs and medicines, consult Publication \# TX 94-155 - Sales Tax Exemption for Over-the-Counter Drugs and Medicines.

# Chapter III <br> Methods of Tax Determination 

- Cash Register Keys
- Computer-Generated Sales Registers
- Retail Inventory Method
- Gross Profit Method (Shelf Test)

Retailers now use various record-keeping systems. Several methods of determining the taxes due are also used, including:

- separate keys on cash registers used to indicate taxable or nontaxable sales
- computer-generated sales registers
- retail inventory method
- gross profit method
- estimated taxable percentage
- special reporting methods allowed by statute


## Cash Register Keys

Retailers, particularly the smaller ones, have a relatively simple method of indicating taxable or nontaxable sales through the use of separate keys on the cash registers. The retailer will usually have a separate key identifying tax collected. Reported taxable sales will consist of the monthly or quarterly tax collected amount divided by the applicable tax rate. When this procedure is used:

- determine the taxpayer's knowledge as to which items are taxable and which are exempt from tax;
- determine what guidelines or information have been given to the cashiers to determine taxability;
- determine the taxpayer's exact sales tax reporting procedures;
- trace the postings of taxable sales and tax collected from cash register tapes to summary records and to the tax returns; and
- verify the reliability of this procedure by comparing it to the results of the application of the purchase ratio method, at least on a preliminary sample basis.


## Computer-Generated Sales Registers

A rapidly expanding method of recording sales transactions is the use of "product code" recognition for checkout stations. This system uses the standardized manufacturer's product identification code on the wrapper of the merchandise. Various scanners read the coding and a central computer system matches the product code with the selling price of the item and records this amount on the checkout stand register tape. The taxability of the product is also determined by the central computer system that obtains the total tax due on each transaction.

An audit of a taxpayer using the "product code" system may be limited to:

- verification of the correct internal coding for taxable and nontaxable items;
- verification of summary records generated by the system; and
- the inclusion of all receipts for report periods.

NOTE: Internal codings should be obtained for the entire audit period. A taxpayer's determination of the taxability of an item may have changed during the audit period. In addition, the taxability of products may have changed during the audit period.

## Retail Inventory Method

Some large convenience store chains use the retail inventory method as a method of sales and inventory control, i.e., for loss and theft, etc. Generally, records do not reflect a "tax collected" amount.

Convenience stores have a high rate of employee turnover. Sometimes, the employees are instructed to collect tax whenever in doubt. This usually leads to an over-collection of tax. These amounts are due to the state unless the overages can be refunded back to the original customer.

Under the retail inventory method, all purchases are priced at retail at the time of receipt. Inventories are generally taken on a weekly or bi-monthly basis. The taxpayer determines book sales using the following procedure:

```
Beginning inventory at retail (actual)
+ Purchases marked up to retail
Merchandise available for sale at retail
- Ending inventory at retail (actual)
Book sales at retail
```

The taxpayer then compares the book sales amount to the actual sales to determine an overage <loss> adjustment to inventory:

```
Actual sales at retail
- Book sales at retail
Overage <loss> adjustment
```

The taxpayer should report sales tax based on the taxable portion of book sales.

For a sales tax audit to be conducted on a taxpayer using the retail inventory method, inventory and purchases must be identifiable by product and the actual physical inventories must have been made. Verify the taxpayer's calculations of sales tax using the purchase ratio method (except that purchases are recorded at retail prices). The general concepts of the purchase ratio method are covered later in Chapter IV, Section I.

## NOTES:

- The overage/<loss> adjustment may not be applied to purchases unless taxable and/or nontaxable substantiated losses can be established.
- See substantiated losses section.


## Gross Profit Method

Basically, the markup method is to be used only when all purchases are available for the entire audit period, but the sales records are not. It involves applying a gross profit markup percentage to the adjusted cost of goods sold to estimate sales. This procedure may be used when the expense and cost of goods sold records
are adequate but the sales records are inadequate. Or, this method may be used to substantiate the reliability of sales records. The gross profit method is most effectively used on businesses in which the unit sales price is small, the volume of transactions is large, and gross profit markup does not fluctuate greatly.

Using the gross profit method, sales may be estimated with a fair degree of accuracy. This is done by calculating a weighted markup through a shelf test of the merchandise purchased.

A standard shelf test includes:

- an actual physical examination of products, quantities, price tags, price stickers, signs or any other devices used to inform the customer of the sales price. Standard catalogs and price lists may also be used when other sources are unavailable.
- the computation of a markup percentage after testing items purchased.

The last step is to determine audited gross sales:

```
Calculated Markup Percentage + 100%
X Cost of Goods Sold
Audited Gross Sales
```

Since the markup is based on the cost of purchases, the percentage used in calculating sales will be the markup percentage plus 100 percent, with 100 percent representing the original cost of the purchase.

## EXAMPLE

Adjusted Cost of Goods Sold for a Period $=\$ 7,200$
Markup Percentage $=30 \%$
$\$ 7,200 \times 1.30=\$ 9,360$ (Gross Sales)

| Invoice Date |  | Product | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | Total Purchase Price | Sales Price Per Item | Items Per Unit | \# of Units <br> Purchased | Total Retail Sale |
|  |  |  | from invoice | per shelf test | * | from invoice | $(2) *(3) *(4)$ |
| 01/03/2014 | 10708 | Beer-Qts | 50.75 | 1.99 | 10 | 3 | 59.70 |
| 01/10/2014 | Stmt | Milk-Gal | 66.86 | 1.99 | 12 | 4 | 95.52 |
| 02/02/2014 | 80692 | Bkfts Cereal | 25.44 | 2.12 | 12 | 2 | 50.88 |
| 02/07/2014 | 10912 | Beer-6 pack (Cans) | 98.07 | 2.99 | 4 | 10 | 119.60 |
| 03/03/2014 | 2001 | Cola-6-pack (Cans) | 49.80 | 2.49 | 4 | 10 | 99.60 |
| 03/13/2014 | Stmt | Bread-Loaf | 22.49 | 0.99 | 8 | 4 | 31.68 |
| 04/04/2014 | 1999 | Cola-Plastic (liter) | 87.56 | 1.99 | 8 | 10 | 159.20 |
| 04/11/2014 | 53399 | Canned Corn | 13.71 | 0.84 | 12 | 2 | 20.16 |
| 04/17/2014 | 11723 | Cigarettes-Regular | 503.10 | 4.30 | 10 | 15 | 645.00 |
| 05/02/2014 | 21606 | Candy | 42.00 | 0.35 | 30 | 2 | 21.00 |
| 05/22/2014 | 4156 | Motor Oil | 44.06 | 4.59 | 12 | 2 | 110.16 |
| 06/01/2014 | 54396 | Ketchup | 49.92 | 1.04 | 24 | 4 | 99.84 |
| 06/01/2014 | 16540 | Paper Towels | 64.30 | 0.94 | 30 | 6 | 169.20 |
| 06/28/2014 | 1130 | Grape Drink | 20.03 | 0.89 | 10 | 5 | 44.50 |
| 07/13/2014 | 6611 | Canned Spaghetti | 23.33 | 1.62 | 12 | 2 | 38.88 |
| 08/01/2014 | 9950 | 10-pack Garbage Bags | 49.75 | 1.99 | 10 | 5 | 99.50 |
| 08/19/2014 | 1050 | Pet Food (Cans) | 17.64 | 0.49 | 24 | 3 | 35.28 |
| 09/17/2014 | 8608 | Detergent-64 Oz | 107.73 | 3.99 | 12 | 5 | 239.40 |
| 09/20/2014 | 35995 | Tomato Sauce-8 Oz | 26.68 | 0.38 | 36 | 3 | 41.04 |
| 10/03/2014 | 7404 | Chicken Noodle Soup | 19.15 | 0.57 | 24 | 2 | 27.36 |
| 10/03/2014 | 34424 | Bath Soup-Bars | 18.41 | 0.59 | 24 | 2 | 28.32 |
|  |  |  | \$1,400.78 |  |  |  | \$2,235.82 |

Gross Profits $=$ Total Retail Sales - Total Purchase Price $=\$ 2,235.82-\$ 1,400.78=\$ 835.04$
Mark up $=$ Gross Profit $/$ Total Purchase Price $=\$ 835.04 / \$ 1,400.78=59.6125 \%$
Total Purchases (Adjusted Cost of Goods Sold) will be multiplied by 1.5961 .25 in order to calculate Gross Sales

# Chapter IV <br> <br> Miscellaneous Taxpayer Store Topics 

 <br> <br> Miscellaneous Taxpayer Store Topics}

- 5 Percent Audit Allowance
- Actual Substantiated Losses
- Penalty and Interest Application
- Allowance for Bad Debts
- Consignment and Commission Sales
- Coupons and Premiums
- Vending Machine Sales
- Items Purchased by Customers with Food Stamps/Lone Star Card
- Combination Grocery and Snack Bar or Delicatessen
- Items Withdrawn from Inventory for Use
- Wrapping and Packaging Supplies


## 5 Percent Audit Allowance

An allowance of 5 percent of audited gross taxable sales must be allowed as a deduction for pilferage, shrinkage, spoilage, and any possible errors inherent in projection techniques for audits completed using the purchase ratio method (Method B) and any audits using a markup or estimation method.

## THE 5 PERCENT ALLOWANCE IS FOR AUDIT PURPOSES ONLY AND CANNOT BE USED FOR REPORTING PURPOSES BY A TAXPAYER UNDER ANY CIRCUMSTANCES.

As previously mentioned, it is important to take this 5 percent factor into consideration when determining whether to continue with the audit field work after performing a sample examination of the taxpayer's purchase invoices. As an example, a taxpayer has taxable sales that are 30 percent of audited gross sales. A 5 percent allowance of taxable sales amounts to 1.5 percent of gross sales (. 30 X .05 ). This percentage increases as the amount of the taxpayer's reported percentage of taxable sales to gross sales increases.

## Example:

| Description | Situation \#1 | Situation \#2 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Gross Sales | $\$ 45,000.00$ | $\$ 45,000.00$ |
| Percent of Taxable Sales | $30 \%$ | $45 \%$ |
| Gross Taxable Sales (Gross Sales multiplied by percent of taxable sales) | $\$ 13,500.00$ | $\$ 20,250.00$ |
| $5 \%$ Allowance | $5 \%$ | $5 \%$ |
| Amount of Allowance (Gross Taxable Sales multiplied by 5\%) | $\$ 675.00$ | $\$ 1,012.50$ |
| Relationship to Gross Sales (Amount of Allowance divided by Gross Sales) | $1.5 \%$ | $2.25 \%$ |

## Actual Substantiated Losses

If the taxpayer can substantiate actual inventory losses above the 5 percent allowance previously described, the purchases percentage computation is adjusted for the substantiated loss. However, the taxpayer must be able to substantiate what items were lost. For example, in cases of theft, the taxpayer must be able to provide a police report listing the items stolen.

## Example

Total Purchases of $\$ 150,000$ less total losses of $\$ 5,500$ equals $\$ 148,500$ for adjusted purchases.
Taxable Purchases of $\$ 75,000$ less a substantiated loss of $\$ 1,500$ for cigarettes equals $\$ 73,500$ for adjusted purchases.

NOTE: If the markup audit, rather than the purchase ratio method, is performed, the purchase amounts still have to be taken into account. Again, the taxpayer must be able to substantiate a loss and what items were lost (spoiled, stolen, etc.). The purchases of taxable items would be reduced by the substantiated losses before applying the markup percentage.

Losses must be substantiated with proper documentation: police reports, fire reports, insurance claims, inventory studies, etc. The taxpayer may further substantiate the loss by performing a physical inventory.

Taxpayers may establish losses for:

- taxable purchases,
- nontaxable purchases or
- an overall loss on purchases.

NOTE: Besides adjustments to purchases for substantiated losses, the taxpayer would also be entitled to the 5 percent allowance previously discussed.

## Penalty and Interest Application

A taxpayer utilizing one of the optional special reporting methods for taxpayers must pay penalties and/or interest if a tax report is not filed on or before the due date or the correct amount of tax due is not remitted with the report. The only exception to penalty and interest is:

- penalty and interest will not be assessed on additional taxes found to be due by audit when the taxpayer uses Method B (purchase ratio method) for reporting purposes. This penalty and interest exemption will be lost if the taxpayer has not recomputed the taxable percentage each year.


## Allowance for Bad Debts

A taxpayer is entitled to take a deduction for bad debts if the taxable transaction was previously reported or if the transaction occurred in the current reporting period. The bad debt must also be recorded and have been or will be written off for federal income tax purposes.

A taxpayer's bad debts generally consist of insufficient fund checks and unpaid charge accounts for which the taxpayer does not have itemized listings of taxable and nontaxable sales. The taxpayer may apply the same percentage computed under the Purchase Ratio method to bad debts to determine the amount of deduction.

The following factors must be considered before allowing bad debts:

- Examine original or copies of all insufficient fund checks.
- Determine whether the insufficient fund checks represent sales of merchandise or whether they represent check cashing. Losses for insufficient checks will not be allowed if the loss was for cashing a check.

NOTE: Allowances for bad debts are made in addition to any other allowances previously mentioned (5 percent allowance, tax included in gross sales and substantiated losses).

## Consignment and Commission Sales

Consignment means that goods are in the physical possession of the consignee (taxpayer) but title remains with the consignor (vendor). Title passes to the customer through the consignee at the point of sale. The taxpayer only receives either a fixed amount or a percentage of the sales. The consignee may record in gross sales the amount of the full retail price to the customer and may record in purchases the amount of the wholesale price. If the taxpayer handles consignment sales in this manner, include the consignment purchase transaction in the total purchases and the taxable or nontaxable purchases (depending on the item) amounts for the purchase ratio method.

Another method utilized by taxpayers regarding consignment and commission sales is whereby the taxpayer only records the commissions received in income and does not record the sale or purchases amounts in the accounting books. Consequently, the commission transaction would not be included in the purchase ratio method computations. An adjustment to gross sales may be necessary if commission receipts are included in reported gross sales.

## Coupons and Premiums

Coupons redeemed by the taxpayer fall into two categories:

- Those for which the taxpayer is reimbursed for the face value of the coupon plus a handling fee (manufacturer's coupons); and
- Those for which there is no reimbursement to the taxpayer (in-store coupons).

Both of the above coupons are handled in the same manner. The coupons represent a reduction of the item purchased by the customer. Tax is to be collected by the taxpayer on the net price (price after allowing for reduction of the face value of the coupon).

Periodically, a taxpayer may, as an inducement to attract customers, offer to double or triple the face value of manufacturers' coupons. These promotions would also qualify as reductions of the sales price and the tax would be due on the reduced sales price.

Verification must be made that the taxpayer is handling the tax implications of coupons correctly. If the taxpayer is collecting tax on the gross sales price of the item before reducing the price for coupons, this constitutes tax collected in error, and the total amount of this tax is due and is to be allocated to the state.

A premium is an item offered by retailers to attract customers.

- If the premium is given and there is no additional charge for the premium, the purchase of the premium by the taxpayer is not for resale. The taxpayer should pay tax to the vendor of the premium or report and pay the tax to the comptroller on the Taxable Purchases section of the sales and use tax report.
- If the premium is given, and there is an additional charge for the premium, the purchase of the premium is for resale. Tax is due on either the retailer's cost or the amount charged the customer, whichever is greater.


## Vending Machine Sales

Some examples of vending machines located in convenience stores are soft drink machines, postage stamp machines, gumball machines, candy machines and newspapers sold through a rack. All sales of postage stamps and newspapers are not taxable. In addition, sales of food, gum and candy sold through bulk vending machines for 50 cents or less are exempt.

Items sold through vending machines in convenience stores must be addressed separately. Separate records should be maintained by the taxpayer in order to substantiate vending machine sales. The taxpayer should be able to itemize not only the sales amounts but also items sold through vending machines. If the purchase ratio method of auditing is performed, adjustments to purchases are necessary for the merchandise sold through the vending machines. If a markup percentage method is utilized, purchases of merchandise sold through the vending machines must be excluded before applying the percentage.

If the taxpayer does not maintain records to substantiate vending machine sales, then include vending machine receipts in gross sales and apply the taxable percentage appropriately if performing a purchase ratio method audit. If performing some type of markup audit, include the purchases of items sold through vending machines and apply the applicable markup percentage.

## Items Purchased by Customers with Food Stamps/Lone Star Card

Food stamps may be used by customers to purchase both items exempt from sales tax (food items) and items, if qualifying, which are subject to sales tax (soft drinks, candy, ice cream novelties, etc.). When a customer uses both food stamps and cash to pay for a purchase of both taxable and non-taxable items, the food stamps should first be applied to taxable items.

## Example:

A customer purchases multiple items totaling $\$ 10, \$ 5$ of which consists of soft drinks and candy. Both items are subject to sales tax, but they may be legally purchased with food stamps. If the customer pays for the entire purchase with food stamps, the taxpayer would not report any taxable sales on the transaction. However, if the customer only has $\$ 3$ in food stamps, the taxpayer should apply the $\$ 3$ in food stamps to the first $\$ 3$ of the charge for soft drinks and candy and collect tax on the remaining $\$ 2$.

To qualify to accept food stamps for payment of sales, the taxpayer must maintain records supporting food stamp sales. The taxpayer must also maintain adequate records to support reported taxable and non-taxable sales.

NOTE: In Texas, qualifying individuals utilize the Lone Star Card for making the qualifying purchases.
When we make audit adjustments using an audit method where we are unable to distinguish between taxable products that can be purchased with food stamps and taxable products that are not eligible to be purchased with food stamps, we will allow a food stamp reduction to audited taxable sales based on a pro rata percentage. The pro rata percentage will be determined by dividing total food stamps processed in the audit period by total audited gross sales in the audit period. The resulting percentage will be applied to audited taxable sales to determine the allowable offset to taxable sales due to food stamp purchases. Note: The application of the pro rata percentage against the entire taxable sales amount will not apply to estimated audits since we utilize a product mix percentage and can therefore determine amounts of eligible and non-eligible items. An example on how to calculate this "allowable percentage" is below:

Total Food Stamps Processed in the Audit Period divided by Total Gross Sales in the audit period equals Food Stamp Allowance Percentage

Food Stamp Allowance Percentage multiplied by taxable sales equals allowance offset for nontaxable.

## Example:

During the audit period, a taxpayer had $\$ 100,000$ in gross sales and $\$ 60,000$ in taxable sales, and processed $\$ 50,000$ worth of food stamps. Note: Again, we will not apply the allowance percentage to the total taxable sales amount in an estimate. The allowance percentage will instead only be applied to qualifying items. See below for more on qualifying items.

Food stamp allowance percentage $=\$ 50,000 / \$ 100,000=50 \%$

Allowable offset for food stamp sales $=50 \% \mathrm{X} \$ 60,000=\$ 30,000$

When we make audit assessments utilizing specific product scanner codes or using our current estimation procedures, we currently do not allow any offset for food stamps on products (e.g., beer, cigarettes, cosmetics, etc.) that are not eligible for purchase with food stamps under federal law.

Therefore, any non-qualifying items in taxable sales should be subtracted before applying the percentage. Utilizing the above example, if the auditor determined that $\$ 20,000$ of the taxable sales amount consisted of beer (not qualified for food stamp purchase), the amount would be subtracted from the $\$ 60,000$, and the allowable offset for food stamp sales would be $\$ 20,000(\$ 60,000-\$ 20,000 \times 50 \%=\$ 20,000)$.

## Purchase Ratio Method and Food Stamps:

When we make audit adjustments using the purchase ratio method, we will allow food stamps to offset taxable sales, not to exceed the amount of sales associated with qualifying food stamp purchases, if known

## Example:

During the audit period the taxpayer's total purchases was $\$ 100,000$. Of that amount, $\$ 50,000$ was purchases of taxable items. In addition, the taxpayer had accepted $\$ 40,000$ in food stamps during the audit period. The auditor determined that of the $\$ 50,000, \$ 20,000$ consisted of non-qualifying items (beer, cigarettes, etc.). The allowable offset for food stamp sales would be $\$ 30,000$.
$\$ 40,000 / \$ 100,000=40 \%$ food stamp allowance percentage
$\$ 50,000-\$ 20,000=\$ 30,000$ qualifying taxable items that can be purchased with food stamps

Since our offset cannot exceed the amount of qualifying sales associated with food stamps, we will only allow $\$ 30,000$ of the total $\$ 40,000$ in food stamp sales to offset taxable purchases in this situation.

## Combination Grocery and Snack Bar or Delicatessen

If a convenience store has a separately identifiable snack bar or delicatessen with food for immediate consumption, all sales and purchases of each must be segregated and audited independently.

- Audit of Sales
» If separate sales records for the snack bar/delicatessen are maintained either through a separate cash register or tax key, segregate these sales from the convenience store's sales.
» If separate sales records are not maintained, a reasonable estimate of sales should be made utilizing test periods and any available records.
- Audit of Purchases
» Separate those purchases made directly for the snack bar/delicatessen so that they will not be included in the purchase ratio percentage or markup percentage computation.
» A reasonable estimate will have to be made for any portion of grocery items such as bread, meat, etc. that are withdrawn from the taxpayer's inventory for use in the snack bar/delicatessen.


## Items Withdrawn from Inventory for Use

A taxpayer's liability for taxable purchases is generally limited to:

- Merchandise withdrawn from inventory for business use
» Consists of such taxable items as cleaning supplies, brooms, paper products, etc. These items should be scheduled separately as adjustments to taxable purchase.
- Merchandise withdrawn from inventory for personal use
» Many taxpayers, especially small proprietors, will withdraw both taxable and exempt merchandise for home use. Unless the taxpayer maintains records that list the items withdrawn for home use, the same percentage factor utilized in the purchase ratio method audit of the convenience store can be applied to these withdrawals. These items should also be scheduled separately as adjustments to taxable purchases.

Note: Amounts for merchandise withdrawn may be obtained from the cost of goods sold section of the taxpayer's federal income tax return.

## Wrapping and Packaging Supplies

A taxpayer must pay tax on all boxes, paper sacks and plastic bags used to package or repackage items for sale. A taxpayer can claim an exemption for any wrapping and packaging materials used in processing items resold (items for the meat department, deli department and bakery department). The taxpayer must pay tax on all paper and plastic bags used to package products purchased by customers. Make adjustments to taxable purchases for any non-qualifying tax-free purchases of wrapping/packaging materials purchased by the taxpayer.

## ChapterV

## Auditing Procedures

- Purchase Ratio Method
- Exhibit - Transaction Entry
- Markup Methods
- Lack of Records
- Exhibit - Letter to Vendor
- Exhibit - Vendor's Records
- Exhibit - Notification of Estimation
- Beer, Wine and Tobacco Vendor Data
- Alternative Markup Factors

This chapter will deal with auditing procedures, with emphasis on the purchase ratio and markup procedures. Various auditing issues encountered throughout the years will also be discussed.

## Purchase Ratio Method

Briefly, under this auditing method, an analysis will be made of the taxpayer's purchases of inventory items for a representative sample period. A percentage relationship between taxable merchandise (items, when sold, on which the taxpayer must collect tax from the customer) and total purchases will be established. This percentage will then be applied to the taxpayer's gross sales throughout the audit period.

## Gross Sales

Since the percentage ratio will be applied to the taxpayer's gross sales, less any adjustments, it is extremely important for the auditor to verify gross sales. If gross sales were not correctly reported, the auditor must establish the correct amounts for gross sales for the entire audit period. At the very least, a close approximation to the taxpayer's gross sales must be obtained utilizing available accounting records and auditing techniques.

Adjustments, where applicable, need to be made to audited gross sales. The taxable percentage ratio obtained must be applied only to sales that are attributable to the taxpayer's operation. Such items, previously discussed, as delivery charges, commissions, deli/restaurant operation, lotto sales, hunting/fishing licenses, phone cards etc. must be deducted from audited gross sales/total receipts before applying the taxable percentage.

Below is an example of a schedule that was performed with some examples of adjustments made to audited gross sales. This schedule is for illustration purposes only and does not represent all of the potential adjustments to audited gross sales.

Worth Corporation

## Exam 1B <br> TP\# 12345678903 <br> Page 1 of 1

Fort Worth, Texas
Additional Taxable Sales

|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Report Period | Audited Gross Sales (from taxpayer's sales journal) | Less: Gasoline Sales (from taxpayer's sales journal) | Less: Lotto Sales (from taxpayer's sales journal) | Net Audited Gross Sales (1-2-3) |
| 1201 | \$233,132.00 | \$134,627.00 | \$895.00 | \$97,610.00 |
| 1202 | 233,967.00 | 135,347.00 | 920.00 | 97,700.00 |
| 1203 | 217,500.00 | 118,075.00 | 1,010.00 | 98,415.00 |
| 1204 | 226,377.00 | 126,482.00 | 1,040.00 | 98,855.00 |
| 1205 | 242,931.00 | 141,946.00 | 1,150.00 | 99,835.00 |
| 1206 | 208,208.00 | 106,493.00 | 1,210.00 | 100,505.00 |
| 1207 | 247,739.00 | 144,269.00 | 1,250.00 | 102,220.00 |
| 1208 | 216,377.00 | 113,817.00 | 1,205.00 | 101,355.00 |
| 1209 | 200,743.00 | 99,033.00 | 1,165.00 | 100,545.00 |
| 1210 | 215,044.00 | 115,939.00 | 1,105.00 | 98,000.00 |
| 1211 | 210,584.00 | 112,724.00 | 1,055.00 | 96,805.00 |
| 1212 | 207,350.00 | 106,210.00 | 1,095.00 | 100,045.00 |
| Total | \$2,659,952.00 | \$1,454,962.00 | \$13,100.00 | \$1,191,890.00 |

NOTE: The taxable ratio percentage will be applied to the amounts in Col. 4 on a period-by-period basis.

## Computing the Taxable Percentage

Once the auditor has verified gross sales, or obtained gross sales amounts by other means, the taxable percentage to be applied to the sales amounts must be computed. Utilizing Comptroller sampling standards, a sample period is obtained. As in any other type of sales and use tax audit, the sample period selected must be representative of the entire audit period. The invoices for purchases of merchandise resold through the operation will be examined for the sample period. A percentage relationship will be established between merchandise items that are taxable when resold and total purchases for the sample period. Items such as phone cards that are taxable (but not a grocery item) should be added back to audited taxable sales after obtaining and applying the taxable percentage to audited gross sales.

Sometimes an item's taxability can change due to a change in the law, such as sunscreen becoming exempt from sales tax effective June 18, 2012. In order to take this fact into account, the auditor must schedule these "tax change items" separately and arrive at two taxable percentages:

- one for the periods before the change and
- one for those periods after the change.

Below is a sample schedule that could be prepared to compute the taxable percentage to be applied to sales. The auditor must prepare an Excel spreadsheet in order to schedule the merchandise purchases for the sample period. This schedule is for illustration purposes only as the auditor may need to tailor the schedule to fit his/her audit's needs.

Worth Corporation
Exam 1C
Fort Worth, Texas
Additional Taxable Sales
TP\# 12345678903

| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Vendor | Date | Invoice\# | Description | Taxable Amount | Tax Change Amount | Total Amount |
| Joe's Whosl Groc | 05/02/2012 | 362230 | HBC, Sunscreen, Food items | \$2,638.35 | \$- | \$4,529.00 |
| M N M Beer Co | 05/02/2012 | 154499 | Beer | 2,945.00 | - | 2,945.00 |
| Chris's Chips | 05/03/2012 | 164017 | Chips | - | - | - |
| Tommy's Meats | 05/02/2012 | 243240 | Meat, Lunch meat | - | - | - |
| Paul's Medical | 05/08/2012 | 400192 | Aspirin, cold med | - | - | - |
| Mr. Harvey's Br | 05/10/2012 | 558614 | Bread, Buns, Snacks | - | - | - |
| ABC Beer Co | 05/11/2012 | 621470 | Beer | 4,050.00 | - | 4,050.00 |
| Coca-Cola Bottling | 05/12/2012 | 483820 | Water, Energy Drinks | 3,285.00 | - | 4,784.00 |
| Tommy's Meats | 05/12/2012 | 195834 | Meat, Lunch meat | - | - | - |
| Pepsi Bottling | 05/13/2012 | 538564 | Water, Energy Drinks | 3,235.00 | - | 4,249.00 |
| USA Yesterday | 05/13/2012 | 379983 | Newspapers | - | - | - |
| Sam's Ciggies | 05/15/2012 | 295147 | Cigarettes | 4,590.00 | - | 4,590.00 |
| Chris's Chips | 05/22/2012 | 192742 | Chips | - | - | - |
| M N M Beer Co | 05/23/2012 | 566668 | Beer | 2,655.00 | - | 2,655.00 |
| Farm Fresh Milk | 05/26/2012 | 223965 | Milk | - | - | - |
| ZYX Beer | 05/28/2012 | 418211 | Beer | 4,145.00 | - | 4,145.00 |
| Mr. Harvey's Br | 05/29/2012 | 437984 | Bread, Buns, Snacks | - | - | - |
| Joe's Whosl Groc | 06/18/2012 | 172082 | HBC, Sunscreen, Food items | 529.00 | 2,102.20 | 3,023.00 |
| M N M Beer Co | 06/01/2012 | 423825 | Beer | 4,255.00 | - | 4,255.00 |
| Chris's Chips | 06/02/2012 | 140593 | Chips | - | - | - |
| Tommy's Meats | 06/01/2012 | 633625 | Meat, Lunch meat | - | - | - |
| Paul's Medical | 06/07/2012 | 527731 | Aspirin, cold med | - | - | - |
| Mr. Harvey's Br | 06/09/2012 | 379806 | Bread, Buns, Snacks | - | - | - |
| ABC Beer Co | 06/10/2012 | 568389 | Beer | 4,164.00 | - | 4,164.00 |
| Coca=Cola Bottling | 06/11/2012 | 496997 | Water, Energy Drinks | 3,168.00 | - | 5,101.00 |
|  |  |  |  | \$39,659.35 | \$2,102.20 | \$48,490.00 |

Taxable Percentage: Periods Prior to Taxability Change (Col. $5+\mathrm{Col} .6) / \mathrm{Col} 7$
86.1240\%

Taxable Percentage: Periods After Taxability Change (Col. 5/Col. 7)
81.7887\%

Note: Sunscreen was taxable from 9/1/07 through 6/27/12

If an invoice lists both taxable and nontaxable merchandise, list examples of both in the "Description" column.
NOTE: For the above example, a random computer-generated month sample was utilized using CATS.

## Application of the 5 Percent Allowance

The 5 percent allowance is applied to audited gross taxable sales for each period in the audit, even if a period results in a credit amount. However, if after application of the 5 percent allowance, the audit results in an overall credit, the audit becomes a "no tax due" audit. Application of the 5 percent allowance will never result in an overall credit audit.

Example of application of 5 percent allowance utilizing the previous examples of Worth Corporation:

Worth Corporation
Fort Worth, Texas
Additional Taxable Sales

Exam 1B
TP\# 12345678903
Page 1 of 1

|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Report <br> Period | Net Audited Gross Sales | Taxable Percentage (From Exam 1C) | Audited Taxable Sales (Col. 1 X Col. 2) | $5 \%$ <br> Allowance for Spoilage, Theft | Adjusted <br> Audited Taxable Sales (Col. 3 X Col. 4) | Reported <br> Taxable <br> Sales per TP History) | Additional Taxable Sales (Col. 5 Col. 6) |
| 1201 | 97,610.00 | 86.1240\% | 84,065.64 | 95\% | 79,862.35 | 19,701.00 | 60,161.35 |
| 1202 | 97,700.00 | 86.1240\% | 84,143.15 | 95\% | 79,935.99 | 19,724.00 | 60,211.99 |
| 1203 | 98,415.00 | 86.1240\% | 84,758.93 | 95\% | 80,520.99 | 19,885.00 | 60,635.99 |
| 1204 | 98,855.00 | 86.1240\% | 85,137.88 | 95\% | 80,880.99 | 19,979.00 | 60,901.99 |
| 1205 | 99,835.00 | 86.1240\% | 85,981.90 | 95\% | 81,682.80 | 20,197.00 | 61,485.80 |
| 1206 | 100,505.00 | 81.7887\% | 82,201.73 | 95\% | 78,091.65 | 20,343.00 | 57,748.65 |
| 1207 | 102,220.00 | 81.7887\% | 83,604.41 | 95\% | 79,424.19 | 20,694.00 | 58,730.19 |
| 1208 | 101,355.00 | 81.7887\% | 82,896.94 | 95\% | 78,752.09 | 20,512.00 | 58,240.09 |
| 1209 | 100,545.00 | 81.7887\% | 82,234.45 | 95\% | 78,122.73 | 20,342.00 | 57,780.73 |
| 1210 | 98,000.00 | 81.7887\% | 80,152.93 | 95\% | 76,145.28 | 19,821.00 | 56,324.28 |
| 1211 | 96,805.00 | 81.7887\% | 79,175.55 | 95\% | 75,216.77 | 19,572.00 | 55,644.77 |
| 1212 | 100,045.00 | 81.7887\% | 81,825.50 | 95\% | 77,734.23 | 20,228.00 | 57,506.23 |
| Total | \$1,191,890.00 |  | \$996,179.00 |  | \$946,370.05 | \$240,998.00 | \$705,372.05 |

## Credit for Food Stamps

In the example above, food stamps (Lone Star Card) were not an issue. If the taxpayer is qualified to accept and if customers have made purchases with food stamps, credit needs to be given for these sales. In the example above, credit would be given after adjusted audited taxable sales. Please refer to Chapter V for the allowable amount of credit for food stamp sales.

Worth Corporation
Exam 1A
Fort Worth, Texas Additional Taxable Sales TP\# 12345678903

|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Report <br> Period | Net Audited Gross Sales | Taxable Percentage (From Exam 1C) | Audited <br> Taxable <br> Sales (Col. <br> 1 X Col. 2) | 5\% <br> Allowance for Spoilage, Theft | Adjusted <br> Audited <br> Taxable <br> Sales (Col. <br> $3 \times$ Col. 4) | Food Stamp Sales per Bank Statements | Reported <br> Taxable <br> Sales per <br> TP History | Additional <br> Taxable <br> Sales (Col. <br> 5-Col. 6 - <br> Col. 7) |
| 1201 | 97,610.00 | 86.1240\% | 84,065.64 | 95\% | 79,862.35 | 1,137.40 | 19,701.00 | 59,023.95 |
| 1202 | 97,700.00 | 86.1240\% | 84,143.15 | 95\% | 79,935.99 | 948.74 | 19,724.00 | 59,263.25 |
| 1203 | 98,415.00 | 86.1240\% | 84,758.93 | 95\% | 80,520.99 | 985.63 | 19,885.00 | 59,650.36 |
| 1204 | 98,855.00 | 86.1240\% | 85,137.88 | 95\% | 80,880.99 | 1,001.60 | 19,979.00 | 59,900.39 |
| 1205 | 99,835.00 | 86.1240\% | 85,981.90 | 95\% | 81,682.80 | 918.66 | 20,197.00 | 60,567.14 |
| 1206 | 100,505.00 | 81.7887\% | 82,201.73 | 95\% | 78,091.65 | 811.25 | 20,343.00 | 56,937.40 |
| 1207 | 102,220.00 | 81.7887\% | 83,604.41 | 95\% | 79,424.19 | 649.41 | 20,694.00 | 58,080.78 |
| 1208 | 101,355.00 | 81.7887\% | 82,896.94 | 95\% | 78,752.09 | 592.07 | 20,512.00 | 57,648.02 |
| 1209 | 100,545.00 | 81.7887\% | 82,234.45 | 95\% | 78,122.73 | 647.22 | 20,342.00 | 57,133.51 |
| 1210 | 98,000.00 | 81.7887\% | 80,152.93 | 95\% | 76,145.28 | 440.20 | 19,821.00 | 55,884.08 |
| 1211 | 96,805.00 | 81.7887\% | 79,175.55 | 95\% | 75,216.77 | 459.32 | 19,572.00 | 55,185.45 |
| 1212 | 100,045.00 | 81.7887\% | 81,825.50 | 95\% | 77,734.23 | 550.39 | 20,228.00 | 56,955.84 |
| Total | \$1,191,890.00 |  | \$996,179.00 |  | \$946,370.05 | \$9,141.89 | \$240,998.00 | \$696,230.16 |

To assess the tax on the above amounts, CATS E\&T Exam \#1 would consist of the auditor entering the amounts of the additional taxable sales, on a period-by-period basis, onto the CATS Exam. The Comptroller's automated audit system would then assess the additional tax, penalty and interest due.

## Exhibit - Transaction Entry



## Markup Methods

The purchase ratio method cannot be used when the auditor determines that sales and purchases cannot be verified using traditional auditing methods. The auditor must estimate taxable sales from whatever information is available. A markup method is the preferred method of auditing convenience stores when the records are unavailable, inadequate or unreliable. The ABC Dictionary for Accountants (Fifth Edition) defines "markon" as "the amount added to cost, in setting selling prices, to cover operating expenses and profit; also, the ratio of the added amount to cost or selling price." What the dictionary refers to as markon, this manual will refer to as "markup." This ratio of the added amount to cost is expressed as a percentage. This markup percentage is the factor by which cost of sales is multiplied to determine, for our purposes, taxable sales. The markup percentage obtained is applied to the taxpayer's purchases; those merchandise items, when resold through the convenience store, would be subject to sales tax. Some of the most common markup methods will be discussed in this section.

## Shelf Test

A shelf test is a general term for procedures used to determine the unit price of merchandise sold. The auditor arrives at the convenience store on a predetermined date and performs an actual physical examination on the products being sold through the convenience store. Procedures are used to determine the unit sales price of the merchandise on the shelves of the convenience store. The auditor would physically view the sales price that is being charged for an item. Purchase invoices are examined for a current period to determine wholesale cost of the items purchased by the taxpayer. If the auditor finds that the taxpayer's purchase records are incomplete, unavailable or unreliable, some or all of the purchases should be obtained from suppliers. Because some items have a higher sales volume than others the auditor should take a weighted average when computing our markup percentages.

If the store is still in business, any markup percentage utilized must be based on a shelf test performed utilizing purchase information obtained from the taxpayer and/or vendors.

If the store is not open, markup percentages should be based on the best information available. The auditor should document what information was used to determine markup percentages and why they utilized that method.

## Markup Based on Purchase Segregation

Briefly, individual markups will be computed for each class/category of merchandise. The percentages of markup computed will be applied to their respective purchase category over the entire audit period. Before using this method, the auditor must determine that an accurate segregation of purchases can be made over the entire audit period. This method is better suited to convenience stores whose merchandise categories are few in number and with a wide variance in markup. In fact, this is the preferred markup method to be utilized when auditing convenience stores. As in the shelf test example above, many, if not all, of the purchases amounts may have to be obtained from the various vendors.

Utilizing the same information as in the previous example, an example of such a shelf test follows. Again, this is only a brief example. The auditor must utilize an adequate product mixture for each product category.

| Invoice Date | Invoice Number | Product | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | Total Purchase Price From Invoice | Sales <br> Price Per Item Per Shelf Test | Items Per Unit Per Invoice | \# Of Units <br> Purchased From Invoice | Total <br> Retail <br> Sale (2) X <br> (3) $\mathrm{X}(4)$ | Markup \% <br> (5) / (1) |
| 08/03/2014 | 415328 | Coca Cola 12oz 6pk can | 167.52 | 3.49 | 4 | 20 | 279.20 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 415328 | Pepsi 12oz 6pk can | 142.13 | 3.29 | 4 | 18 | 236.88 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 415328 | Coca Cola 120z 12pk can | 95.22 | 5.29 | 2 | 15 | 158.70 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 415328 | Pepsi 12 oz 12pk can | 91.62 | 5.09 | 2 | 15 | 152.70 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 415328 | Coca Cola 20oz single bottle | 313.92 | 1.09 | 24 | 20 | 523.20 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 415328 | Pepsi 20oz single bottle | 235.44 | 1.09 | 24 | 15 | 392.40 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 415328 | Dr. Pepper 12oz 6pk can | 184.27 | 3.49 | 4 | 22 | 307.12 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 415328 | Dr. Pepper 12oz 12pk can | 88.87 | 5.29 | 2 | 14 | 148.12 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 415328 | Dr. Pepper 20oz single bottle | 313.92 | 1.09 | 24 | 20 | 523.20 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 415328 | Sunny D 8oz single bottle | 192.24 | 0.89 | 24 | 15 | 320.40 |  |
|  |  | Product Type - Soft Drinks | \$1,825.15 | \$30.10 |  | 174 | \$3,041.92 | 166.67\% |

$\left.\begin{array}{llllllllll} & & \text { (1) } & \text { (2) } & \text { (3) } & \text { (4) } & \text { (5) } & \text { (6) } \\ \text { Sales }\end{array}\right)$

| Invoice Date | Invoice <br> Number | Product | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | Total <br> Purchase Price From Invoice | Sales <br> Price Per Item Per Shelf Test | Items Per Unit Per Invoice | \# Of Units <br> Purchased From Invoice | Total <br> Retail <br> Sale (2) X <br> (3) $\mathrm{X}(4)$ | Markup \% (5) / (1) |
| 08/03/2014 | 94257 | Doritos "big grab" bag | 37.42 | 0.99 | 20 | 3 | 59.40 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 94257 | Lay's"big grab" bag | 37.42 | 0.99 | 20 | 3 | 59.40 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 94257 | Cheetos "big grab" bag | 37.42 | 0.99 | 20 | 3 | 59.40 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 94257 | Doritos single serving bag | 18.52 | 0.49 | 20 | 3 | 29.40 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 94257 | Lay's single serving bag | 18.52 | 0.49 | 20 | 3 | 29.40 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 94257 | Cheetos single serving bag | 18.52 | 0.49 | 20 | 3 | 29.40 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 94257 | Peanuts- single serving bag | 70.09 | 0.89 | 25 | 5 | 111.25 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 94257 | Sunflower seeds-single serving bag | 76.07 | 0.69 | 25 | 7 | 120.75 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 94257 | Pork Rinds-single serving bag | 62.37 | 0.99 | 20 | 5 | 99.00 |  |
| 08/03/2014 | 94257 | Beef Jerky-single serving | 105.18 | 1.59 | 35 | 3 | 166.95 |  |
|  |  | Product Type - Chips/Snacks | \$481.53 | \$8.60 |  | 38 | \$764.35 | 158.73\% |


|  |  |  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Invoice Date | Invoice <br> Number | Product | Total Purchase Price From Invoice | Sales <br> Price Per Item Per Shelf Test | Items Per Unit Per Invoice | \# Of Units <br> Purchased From Invoice | Total <br> Retail <br> Sale (2) X <br> (3) $\mathrm{X}(4)$ | Markup \% <br> (5) / (1) |
| 08/05/2014 | 04018267 | Bud, Bud Light - 12 pk cans | 381.25 | 9.39 | 2 | 25 | 469.50 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 04018267 | Bud, Bud Light - 12 pk Bottles | 381.25 | 9.39 | 2 | 25 | 469.50 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 04018267 | Bud, Bud Light - 18 pk | 157.50 | 13.29 | 1 | 15 | 199.35 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 04018267 | Bud, Bud Light -6 pk cans | 93.00 | 4.89 | 4 | 6 | 117.36 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 04018267 | Bud, Bud Light - Quart | 220.00 | 2.89 | 10 | 10 | 289.00 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 04018267 | Bud, Bud Light-24 oz. | 180.00 | 2.39 | 10 | 10 | 239.00 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 0480587 | Coors, Coors Lt -12 pk Cans | 310.00 | 9.39 | 2 | 20 | 375.60 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 0480587 | Coors, Coors, Lt-12 pk Bottles | 310.00 | 9.39 | 2 | 20 | 375.60 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 0480587 | Coors, Coors Lt - 18 pk | 107.50 | 13.29 | 1 | 10 | 132.90 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 04631154 | Milwaukee Best - 6 pk 16 oz Cans | 135.00 | 3.89 | 4 | 10 | 155.60 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 04631154 | Milwaukee Best - 12 pk | 90.00 | 5.29 | 2 | 10 | 105.80 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 04631154 | Miller, Miller Lite - 12 pk Cans | 315.00 | 9.29 | 2 | 20 | 371.60 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 04631154 | Miller, Miller Lite - 12 pk Bottles | 315.00 | 9.29 | 2 | 20 | 371.60 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 04631154 | Miller, Miller Lite - 18 pk | 115.00 | 13.29 | 1 | 10 | 132.90 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 0438561 | Corona, Corona Lt - 6 pk | 300.00 | 6.49 | 4 | 15 | 389.40 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 0438561 | Corona, Corona Lt - 24 oz | 345.00 | 2.99 | 10 | 15 | 448.50 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 0455672 | Smirnoff Ice-6 pk | 318.75 | 6.79 | 4 | 15 | 407.40 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 0444368 | Zima-6 pk | 212.50 | 6.79 | 4 | 10 | 271.60 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 0451238 | Heineken - 6 pk | 212.50 | 6.79 | 4 | 10 | 271.60 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 04856447 | Mogen David 20/20 | 227.50 | 2.99 | 10 | 10 | 299.00 |  |
| 08/05/2014 | 04856447 | Boone's Farm | 227.50 | 2.99 | 10 | 10 | 299.00 |  |
|  |  | Product Type - Beer \& Wine | \$4,954.25 | \$151.19 |  | 296 | \$6,191.81 | 124.98\% |

Note: A "unit" of beer is typically a case. A case of beer normally contains 24 cans/bottles of beer.

| Invoice Date | Invoice <br> Number | Product | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | Total Purchase Price From Invoice | Sales <br> Price Per Item Per Shelf Test | Items Per Unit Per Invoice | \# Of Units <br> Purchased From Invoice | Total Retail Sale (2) X (3) $\mathrm{X}(4)$ | Markup \% <br> (5) / (1) |
| 08/06/2014 | 0406240059 | Cigarettes - Basic pack | 430.00 | 2.49 | 10 | 20 | 498.00 |  |
| 08/06/2014 | 0406240059 | Benson \& Hedges pack | 600.00 | 3.69 | 10 | 20 | 738.00 |  |
| 08/06/2014 | 0406240059 | Camel pack | 150.00 | 2.89 | 10 | 6 | 173.40 |  |
| 08/06/2014 | 0406240059 | Doral pack | 395.00 | 2.29 | 10 | 20 | 458.00 |  |
| 08/06/2014 | 0406240059 | Newport pack | 640.00 | 3.69 | 10 | 20 | 738.00 |  |
| 08/06/2014 | 0406240059 | Marlboro pack | 147.00 | 2.99 | 10 | 6 | 179.40 |  |
| 08/06/2014 | 0406240059 | Salem pack | 147.00 | 2.89 | 10 | 6 | 173.40 |  |
| 08/06/2014 | 0406240059 | Winston pack | 147.00 | 2.89 | 10 | 6 | 173.40 |  |
| 08/06/2014 | 0406240059 | Kool | 600.00 | 3.69 | 10 | 20 | 738.00 |  |
| 08/06/2014 | 0406240059 | Parliament | 150.00 | 2.89 | 10 | 6 | 173.40 |  |
|  |  | Product Type - Cigarettes | \$3,406.00 | \$30.40 |  |  | \$4,043.00 | 118.70\% |

Note: A "unit" of cigarettes is typically a carton. A carton of cigarettes normally contains 10 packs of cigarettes.

In the above example, the auditor performed the Shelf Test in August 2014. The shelf price was then compared with current purchase invoices which the taxpayer had on hand. The above markup factors are then forwarded to another exam which computes additional taxable sales.

Based on the shelf test utilizing purchase segregation, an example of an exam computing audited taxable grocery sales follows.

| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |

The subsequent exams would follow the same format as in the prior shelf test example.

## Shelf Test Basics

This section pertains to both the shelf test markup and the markup based on purchase segregation.

- If vendors must be contacted in order to estimate an audit liability, all suppliers within a particular purchase category, if available, must be contacted. For example, all soft drink suppliers must be contacted to estimate soft drink sales.
- There will be price fluctuations within any given category of purchases. The auditor needs to get a good mix of product sizes and high- and low-dollar value items. This good mixture of products should overcome any of these price fluctuations.
- Convenience stores generally change their prices as their costs change. Audit experience of the industry has shown that convenience stores, at least the smaller entities, do not maintain a pricing history. Out of necessity, we use current sales prices versus current costs at the time the shelf test is performed.
- A shelf test must be conducted on each active outlet. It should have a minimum of 10 different high/medium volume items for each category. These 10 items should be a mix of the different variety of sizes and brands available for sale (for example, 12 pack, 6 pack, 18 pack, 20 oz , one-liter bottles, quart bottles, smokeless tobacco, cigar products, domestic beer, imported beer, Coors, Budweiser, etc.) as these are often sold with different markups. If the taxpayer does not offer a variety of sizes and brands, it must be documented to explain why at least 10 items were not used.

| (10) | (11) | (12) | (13) | (14) | (15) | (16) | (17) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| AUDITED SOFT DRINK SALES <br> (Col. 8 X Col. 9) | CANDY PURCHASES <br> (Exam 1F) | MARKUP (Exam 1D) | AUDITED CANDY SALES (Col. 11 X Col. 12) | CHIPS/ <br> SNACKS <br> PURCHASES <br> (Exam 1G) | MARKUP (Exam 1D) | AUDITED CHIPS/ SNACKS SALES (Col. 14 X Col. 15) | AUDITED GROCERY TAXABLE SALES $[(4)+(7)+(10)+(13)+(16)$ |
| 25,512.18 | 6,172.00 | 192.28\% | 11,867.52 | 7,262.00 | 158.73\% | 11,526.97 | 128,746.62 |
| 24,987.17 | 6,175.00 | 192.28\% | 11,873.29 | 7,844.00 | 158.73\% | 12,450.78 | 138,516.22 |
| 24,490.49 | 7,432.00 | 192.28\% | 14,290.25 | 7,479.00 | 158.73\% | 11,871.42 | 137,636.72 |
| 24,670.49 | 7,373.00 | 192.28\% | 14,176.80 | 7,308.00 | 158.73\% | 11,599.99 | 137,309.28 |
| 24,523.82 | 6,794.00 | 192.28\% | 13,063.50 | 7,093.00 | 158.73\% | 11,258.72 | 132,745.61 |
| 25,305.51 | 6,044.00 | 192.28\% | 11,621.40 | 7,803.00 | 158.73\% | 12,385.70 | 125,328.41 |
| 24,838.83 | 7,479.00 | 192.28\% | 14,380.62 | 7,488.00 | 158.73\% | 11,885.70 | 136,711.67 |
| 23,942.15 | 7,424.00 | 192.28\% | 14,274.87 | 7,795.00 | 158.73\% | 12,373.00 | 146,734.77 |
| 25,295.51 | 6,306.00 | 192.28\% | 12,125.18 | 7,171.00 | 158.73\% | 11,382.53 | 128,620.73 |
| 25,803.85 | 6,059.00 | 192.28\% | 11,650.25 | 7,941.00 | 158.73\% | 12,604.75 | 137,113.14 |
| 25,588.85 | 7,152.00 | 192.28\% | 13,751.87 | 7,168.00 | 158.73\% | 11,377.77 | 143,386.85 |
| 22,857.12 | 7,402.00 | 192.28\% | 14,232.57 | 7,125.00 | 158.73\% | 11,309.51 | 133,024.53 |
| 297,815.96 | 81,812.00 |  | 157,308.11 | 89,477.00 |  | 142,026.84 | 1,625,874.54 |

- When performing a shelf test, there are a few things that we need to keep in mind:
» Look around the store and take note of what products are being sold, including the brands. This is helpful for verifying the completeness of purchase records when you are trying to compute a product mix (which we will talk about later).
» Take note of the amount of shelf space each product category is taking up. Again, this is useful for verifying purchases for a product mix. For instance, it wouldn't make any sense to see five out of 10 coolers stocked with soft drinks (the other half being beer) when purchase records reflect that soft drinks are less than 10 percent of beer purchases (by volume, not dollars). This would be an indication that the taxpayer's soft drink purchase records are incomplete.
» Take note of the number of registers are present as well as how many employees are working. If the store has two registers and sales records are provided, you should see register tapes from both registers. Also take a look at the register to see how the keys are labeled.
» Look for anything that can change the taxability of items, such as an eating area or a microwave for customer use.
» If the store has a separate deli area that sells prepared food, check to see if it has a separate register used for purchases made from that area. If the deli has a separate register, the taxability of snack food (greater than one serving or more than 2.5 ounces) would be taxable if sold through the deli, but not taxable if sold through the front register. However, keep in mind that unless the store has an advanced POS system, or the sales records to support where the sales were "rung up," we can't distinguish which sales should be taxable and which sales should not (Of course, this is only an issue with snack food; all prepared food or food sold ready for immediate consumption is taxable regardless of which register it was sold at. See Sales and Use Tax Bulletin for August 2007: Ready-To-Eat-Food).


## Tobacco Products Rebates

A taxpayer may receive a rebate from the cigarette manufacturer(s) which reduces the purchase price of tobacco products. This rebate information should be requested from the taxpayer. If provided, these amounts must be deducted from the purchase price of the tobacco products by month. Rebate amounts should always be considered when calculating the markup, when applicable. If the taxpayer or their representative is unable or unwilling to provide rebate information, the computed markup for tobacco will be small or possibly a negative number. If this happens, and the taxpayer does not provide any rebate information, the auditor should utilize the best information available to markup the tobacco products.

An example of how to handle rebate information with regards to calculating a markup is below:

The markup of a particular brand of tobacco products appears to be less than cost. After asking for rebate information, the taxpayer provides documentation that shows the taxpayer was receiving $38 \not \subset$ per pack back via the rebate. In order to calculate the markup correctly, the auditor must take this rebate into consideration.

What if the taxpayer is no longer in business and a shelf test cannot be performed? See section regarding Alternative Markup Factors.

## Lack of Records

Taxpayers may claim that they do not possess the records necessary for an audit of their business activity. Before performing an estimated audit, vendors need to be contacted. In situations with incomplete records, the audit should follow the most current audit policy.

Below is an example of a letter sent by a Comptroller auditor to a vendor in order to obtain purchases made by a convenience store.

## Exhibit - Letter to Vendor

Austin Audit Office
1711 San Jacinto, Suite 410
Central Services Bldg.
Austin, Texas 78711-3003
512-305-9800
Fax 512-305-9875

August 10, 2014

Mr. Sam Smith
Beer Distributor of Austin
111 Pony Dr.
Austin, Texas 78701

RE: Request for purchase information for ABC , Inc.
5809 Longhorn Ave.
Austin, Texas 78709

Dear Mr. Smith:

I am requesting monthly totals of purchases for the above account for the period of August 1, 2010 through July 31, 2014. Please fax the information to the number listed above.

If you have any questions, please call me.

Ralph Norton
Auditor

The above letter must be sent out on the Comptroller's letterhead. At times it may be necessary to follow this letter with a telephone call or a personal visit to the vendor's location.

Vendors should have the necessary records for a four-year audit period. At the least, enough records should be available to allow a representative sample audit of the taxpayer.

Below is an example of a beer vendor's response to a Comptroller auditor's request for records.
Exhibit - Vendor's Records
JOE'S COCA-COLA

Trend ME 08-09 - 07-13
PATH: Cla: CUSTOMER By: Brands Focus: Coke Zero
Acc: 0123456 ABC's Convenience
5809 LONGHORN

| Date | Sales (Cases) | Net Price/Case | Date | Sales (Cases) | Net Price/Case |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Aug-10 | 122 | 14.05 | Sep-12 | 99 | 14.79 |
| Sep-10 | 117 | 13.35 | Oct-12 | 89 | 14.86 |
| Oct-10 | 98 | 12.95 | Nov-12 | 112 | 14.47 |
| Nov-10 | 90 | 14.43 | Dec-12 | 104 | 14.46 |
| Dec-10 | 100 | 14.58 | Jan-13 | 70 | 14.86 |
| Jan-11 | 120 | 14.29 | Feb-13 | 64 | 14.90 |
| Feb-11 | 102 | 14.36 | Mar-13 | 57 | 14.94 |
| Mar-11 | 101 | 14.26 | Apr-13 | 78 | 15.37 |
| Apr-11 | 143 | 14.70 | May-13 | 55 | 14.87 |
| May-11 | 106 | 14.49 | Jun-13 | 78 | 15.60 |
| Jun-11 | 91 | 14.70 | Jul-13 | 72 | 15.60 |
| Jul-11 | 95 | 14.70 | Aug-13 | 70 | 15.47 |
| Aug-11 | 113 | 14.70 | Sep-13 | 93 | 15.31 |
| Sep-11 | 80 | 14.70 | Oct-13 | 55 | 15.21 |
| Oct-11 | 80 | 14.44 | Nov-13 | 72 | 15.27 |
| Nov-11 | 98 | 14.70 | Dec-13 | 46 | 15.43 |
| Dec-11 | 94 | 14.90 | Jan-14 | 58 | 15.49 |
| Jan-12 | 82 | 14.07 | Feb-14 | 46 | 15.60 |
| Feb-12 | 108 | 14.81 | Mar-14 | 70 | 15.31 |
| Mar-12 | 81 | 14.75 | Apr-14 | 51 | 15.60 |
| Apr-12 | 92 | 15.15 | May-14 | 87 | 14.74 |
| May-12 | 90 | 14.99 | Jun-14 | 97 | 14.44 |
| Jun-12 | 91 | 15.15 | Jul-14 | 115 | 14.70 |
| Jul-12 | 92 | 15.15 | Average | 88 | 14.81 |
| Aug-12 | 87 | 15.15 | Total | 4211 |  |

NOTE: House Bill (HB) 11, as enacted by the 80th Legislature, requires wholesalers of alcoholic products and cigarette/tobacco products to file reports with the Comptroller that summarize a convenience store's purchases. Beginning with January 2008, the Comptroller has data of a taxpayer's purchases of alcoholic and tobacco products. Contact of the applicable vendors will no longer be necessary.

If records necessary for the audit cannot be obtained from vendors, an estimated audit may have to be performed. Before estimating an audit, the following steps must be followed:

- Letter 1 - The first request for records must be issued to the taxpayer or to the taxpayer's authorized representative.
- Letter 2 - The second request for records must be issued to the taxpayer or to the taxpayer's authorized representative. (This second letter may not be necessary if the auditor gets a signed statement from the taxpayer stating that all records available have been provided.)
- Auditor fills out a Request for Subpoena of Records form, listing:
» type of subpoena: first party or third party
» name and address of the person or entity to whom subpoena will be served
» name and address of person or entity for whose records subpoena will be served
» detailed description of records for which subpoena will be served
» time period of records
» name of person who will serve the subpoena
» title of person and the Comptroller field office

If, after following the above steps, records have not been obtained, an estimated audit should be performed. However, estimated amounts must be based on some reasonable basis.

Below is an example of a Notification of Estimation issued to a taxpayer.

## Exhibit - Notification of Estimation

## COMPTROLLER OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS STATE OF TEXAS

## NOTIFICATION OF ESTIMATION PROCEDURES FOR STATE TAX AUDIT

| Taxpayer Name | $:$ | Cory, Inc. |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Taxpayer Number | $:$ | 17554983266 |
| Type of Tax | $:$ | Limited Sales, Excise, and Use Tax |
| Audit Period | $:$ | August 1, 2010 through July 31, 2014 |
| Reporting Category | $:$ | Sales Subcategory: Additional Taxable Sales |

1. Reason for estimation (including a description of records which the taxpayer failed to provide after notification from the auditor by letter or subpoena):

Estimation is necessary due to incomplete records. Although some records were provided, there were several missing months as well as missing vendors.
2. The records to be examined in performing the estimation will include (but not limited to):

Vendor records will be used in conjunction with HB 11 data to obtain a more accurate representation of the beer, wine, candy, soda and tobacco purchases.
3. List periods (they may or may not be the entire audit period) being estimated:

August 10, 2010 through July 31, 2014

The periods listed in number 3, under audit are being estimated based on the best information available due to your failure to maintain/provide adequate records for a sample in compliance with Comptroller policy. Since adequate records were not maintained/provided, no credit projections will be allowed based on the estimation procedures used by the Comptroller.
4. Describe procedures taken to perform estimate:


#### Abstract

An average estimated taxable sales amount will be computed for the entire audit period. Actual beer and tobacco purchases were obtained from your vendors and HB 11 data to insure accuracy. Taxable items being sold include beer, general merchandise, soft drinks, candy, other miscellaneous taxable items and tobacco. An average markup or profit margin for beer, general merchandise, soft drinks, for candy, for other miscellaneous taxable items and for tobacco was calculated during a shelf test. Estimated beer sales will be calculated by multiplying beer purchases by the average markup for beer calculated during the shelf test. Estimated tobacco sales will be calculated by multiplying tobacco purchases by the average markup for tobacco calculated during the shelf test. A product mix percentage was calculated by examining three complete months of purchase records for August, September and October 2013. The product mix for beer and tobacco was calculated by dividing the total estimated beer and tobacco sales for the periods of August, September and October 2013 by the estimated taxable sales made in that same period (which was calculated by multiplying beer, general merchandise, soft drink, candy, other miscellaneous taxable items and tobacco purchases by their corresponding markup percentages previously calculated during the shelf test). Estimated total taxable sales for the entire estimation period will be estimated by dividing estimated beer and tobacco sales by the product mix percentage for beer and tobacco. Estimated total taxable sales will then be reduced by 5 percent for theft/spoilage per Comptroller guidelines to arrive at net estimated additional taxable sales for the audit period. Per Comptroller guidelines, the percentage of net estimated additional taxable sales that can be purchased with food stamps (for the audit period) will be reduced by an allowance for food stamps percentage. This food stamp percentage was calculated by dividing the total food stamps processed during the entire audit period by the estimated total sales for the same period. Reported taxable sales will then be subtracted from net estimated taxable sales (after the food stamp allowance) to arrive at estimated additional taxable sales. Additional tax due will then be calculated by multiplying the applicable state and local tax rates to estimated additional taxable sales for each period within the audit.


This notification was hand delivered on Date:

TO: Keith Smith
Title: President

## SIGN HERE >

## Beer, Wine and Tobacco Vendor Data

HB 11, as enacted by the 80th Legislature, amended Tax Code Chapter 151 (Limited Sales, Excise, and Use Tax), Chapter 154 (Cigarette Tax) and Chapter 155 (Cigars and Tobacco Products Tax) by requiring wholesalers and distributors of beer, wine, malt liquor, cigarettes, cigars and tobacco products to file monthly reports with the Comptroller. The wholesaler or distributor shall file the report on or before the 25 th day of each month. The report must contain the following information for the preceding calendar month's sales made to each retailer:

- name of the retailer and address of the retailer's outlet where delivery was made, including city and ZIP code
- sales tax permit number assigned by the Comptroller to the retailer
- retailer's permit or license number assigned by the Texas Alcoholic Beverage Commission
- cigarette permit number or the tobacco permit number, whichever applicable
- monthly net sales made to the retailer by outlet, including the quantity and units sold to the retailer

The wholesalers/distributors began filing these reports with the Comptroller beginning with sales made for January 2008. Thus, the first report was due from the wholesalers/distributors by Feb. 25, 2008. A link was added on the Audit Division's internal website.

The link can be found under the heading of "Taxes and Research." The auditor enters the retailer's sales tax permit number or the retailer's physical address and the beginning and ending periods, by month, as needed. The auditor will be able to obtain all of the beer and other alcoholic beverages and cigarettes and tobacco products purchased by the retailer for the period requested. These data can then be exported into an Excel spreadsheet. If vendor data are not available for an entire audit period, vendors will continue to have to be contacted for retailer sales amounts.

## Alternative Markup Factors (when all records are not available)

The following are guidelines. Each audit is different, and any extraordinary situations will be handled on a case-by-case basis.

Two methods are to be used to perform audits in cases when records are unavailable, inadequate or unreliable.

## - Markup Method - All Purchase Records Available

Purchase information for the entire audit period is obtained from the taxpayer and/or third-party vendors. The auditor performs a shelf test and computes a markup percentage. The markup percentage is applied to the purchase amounts obtained from the taxpayer and/or the third-party vendors. Please refer to the section dealing with the shelf test and the section dealing with markup based on purchase segregation above.

- Markup Method (average taxable sales method) - All Records Not Available

This method is to be used only when purchase invoices are not available for any or all product categories. For example, beer and tobacco product invoices can be obtained from the vendors and/or from HB 11 data at the Audit Division's website, but purchases cannot be obtained from other suppliers. Taxable sales would be estimated using the best information available to make an estimate (statute 111.0042(d) and $111.008(\mathrm{a})$ ). Documentation should be made to justify the estimated procedures utilized. Professional auditor judgment is crucial to this process as well as a review of existing information that is generally available to the public. Examples of source material are:
» Texas Food \& Fuel Association (TFFA) http://txfoodandfuel.org
» National Association of Convenience Stores (NACS) http://www.nacsonline.com

When audits are estimated using alternative sources, the auditor must state in the Notification of Estimation from where the percentages were obtained.

## Product Mix Percentage

When the only known purchase amounts for the entire audit period are beer/tobacco purchases (via HB 11 and/or vendor records) a product mix percentage must be calculated in order to estimate taxable sales for the audit period. The product mix percentage is calculated by examining a few months' worth of complete purchase records and establishing a ratio for each taxable product category. Since the only known purchases for the entire audit period are beer/tobacco purchases, the product mix percentage for beer/tobacco purchases is divided by the total estimated beer/tobacco sales to calculate estimated taxable sales. A brief example of a product mix calculation is below:

## EXAMPLES:

Example \#1 - Purchases Available for Beer and Tobacco Products - Out of Business

- The taxpayer is out of business when the audit is generated.
- The taxpayer's purchase invoices are incomplete or not made available to the auditor.
- The taxpayer's beer and cigarette vendors are known.

The auditor contacts the taxpayer's beer and tobacco products vendors and the HB 11 information on the Audit Division's website in order to obtain the necessary purchase information for the audit period. A shelf test cannot be performed since the taxpayer is out of business. The auditor would obtain the markup percentages using the best information available for the appropriate product category. The auditor would obtain the product mix for beer and tobacco using the best information available. Remember to include only taxable items in your product mix.

| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Period | Beer Purchases (Exam 1B) | Markup (Exam 1D)* | Estimated <br> Beer Sales (Col. 2 X Col. 3) | Tobacco Product Purchases (Exam 1C) | Markup (Exam 1D)* | Estimated Tobacco Products Sales (Col. 5 X Col. 6) |
| 1309 | 32,982.00 | 124.98\% | 41,220.90 | 32,535.00 | 118.70\% | 38,619.05 |
| 1310 | 39,988.00 | 124.98\% | 49,977.00 | 33,048.00 | 118.70\% | 39,227.98 |
| 1311 | 30,677.00 | 124.98\% | 38,340.11 | 40,981.00 | 118.70\% | 48,644.45 |
| 1312 | 33,942.00 | 124.98\% | 42,420.71 | 37,440.00 | 118.70\% | 44,441.28 |
| 1401 | 30,715.00 | 124.98\% | 38,387.61 | 38,342.00 | 118.70\% | 45,511.95 |
| 1402 | 30,455.00 | 124.98\% | 38,062.66 | 31,974.00 | 118.70\% | 37,953.14 |
| 1403 | 36,802.00 | 124.98\% | 45,995.14 | 33,371.00 | 118.70\% | 39,611.38 |
| 1404 | 40,583.00 | 124.98\% | 50,720.63 | 38,268.00 | 118.70\% | 45,424.12 |
| 1405 | $32,417.00$ | 124.98\% | 40,514.77 | 33,111.00 | 118.70\% | 39,302.76 |
| 1406 | 35,889.00 | 124.98\% | 44,854.07 | 35,552.00 | 118.70\% | 42,200.22 |
| 1407 | 40,702.00 | 124.98\% | 50,869.36 | 35,214.00 | 118.70\% | 41,799.02 |
| 1408 | 38,605.00 | 124.98\% | 48,248.53 | 30,646.00 | 118.70\% | 36,376.80 |
|  | 423,757.00 |  | 529,611.50 | 420,482.00 |  | 499,112.13 |

[^0]| (8) | (9) | (10) | (11) | (12) | (13) | (14) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Estimated Beer <br> And Tobacco <br> Sales[(4) + (7)] | Average Product Mix To Taxable Sales** | Estimated Taxable Sales (Col. 8 / Col. 9) | $\begin{gathered} \text { Less 5\% } \\ \text { Allowance*** } \end{gathered}$ | Net Estimated Taxable Sales (Col. $10 \times$ Col. 11) | Less: Taxable Sales Reported | Additional Taxable Sales (Col. 12 - Col. 13) |
| 79,839.95 | 62.5\% | 127,743.92 | 95\% | 121,356.72 | 40,142.00 | 81,214.72 |
| 89,204.98 | 62.5\% | 142,727.97 | 95\% | 135,591.57 | 30,756.00 | 104,835.57 |
| 86,984.56 | 62.5\% | 139,175.30 | 95\% | 132,216.53 | 35,234.00 | 96,982.53 |
| 86,861.99 | 62.5\% | 138,979.19 | 95\% | 132,030.23 | 33,805.00 | 98,225.23 |
| 83,899.56 | 62.5\% | 134,239.30 | 95\% | 127,527.33 | 33,769.00 | 93,758.33 |
| 76,015.80 | 62.5\% | 121,625.28 | 95\% | 115,544.01 | 31,905.00 | 83,639.01 |
| 85,606.52 | 62.5\% | 136,970.43 | 95\% | 130,121.91 | 38,918.00 | 91,203.91 |
| 96,144.75 | 62.5\% | 153,831.60 | 95\% | 146,140.02 | 39,059.00 | 107,081.02 |
| 79,817.52 | 62.5\% | 127,708.04 | 95\% | 121,322.64 | 41,503.00 | 79,819.64 |
| 87,054.30 | 62.5\% | 139,286.87 | 95\% | 132,322.53 | 39,636.00 | 92,686.53 |
| 92,668.38 | 62.5\% | 148,269.40 | 95\% | 140,855.93 | 42,935.00 | 97,920.93 |
| 84,625.33 | 62.5\% | 135,400.53 | 95\% | 128,630.50 | 44,506.00 | 84,124.50 |
| 1,028,723.63 |  | 1,645,957.81 | 11.40 | 1,563,659.92 | 452,168.00 | 1,111,491.92 |

Example \#2 - Purchases Available for Beer and Tobacco Products - Still in Business

- The taxpayer is still in business when the audit is generated.
- The taxpayer's purchase invoices are incomplete or not made available to the auditor.
- The only known vendors are the taxpayer's beer and cigarette distributors.

The auditor obtains the taxpayer's beer and tobacco products from HB 11 information on the Audit Division's website to obtain the necessary purchase information for the audit period. A shelf test must be performed since the taxpayer is still in business. The auditor would apply the shelf test markup percentages for beer and tobacco products to the beer and tobacco products purchases amounts to arrive at the estimated dollar value of beer sales and for tobacco products for the audit period. The estimated dollar amount of beer sales and of tobacco products sales for the audit period will be divided by the applicable product mix percentage obtained using the best information available. Again, remember to only include taxable items in your product mix percentage.

| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Period | Beer Purchases (Exam 1B) | Markup (Exam 1D)* | Estimated Beer Sales (Col. 2 X Col. 3) | Tobacco Product Purchases (Exam 1C) | Markup (Exam 1D)* | Estimated Tobacco Products Sales (Col. 5 X Col. 6) |
| 1309 | 32,982.00 | 129.55\% | 42,728.18 | 32,535.00 | 117.35\% | 38,179.82 |
| 1310 | 39,988.00 | 129.55\% | 51,804.45 | 33,048.00 | 117.35\% | 38,781.83 |
| 1311 | 30,677.00 | 129.55\% | 39,742.05 | 40,981.00 | 117.35\% | 48,091.20 |
| 1312 | 33,942.00 | 129.55\% | 43,971.86 | 37,440.00 | 117.35\% | 43,935.84 |
| 1401 | 30,715.00 | 129.55\% | 39,791.28 | 38,342.00 | 117.35\% | 44,994.34 |
| 1402 | 30,455.00 | 129.55\% | 39,454.45 | 31,974.00 | 117.35\% | 37,521.49 |
| 1403 | 36,802.00 | 129.55\% | 47,676.99 | 33,371.00 | 117.35\% | 39,160.87 |
| 1404 | 40,583.00 | 129.55\% | 52,575.28 | 38,268.00 | 117.35\% | 44,907.50 |
| 1405 | $32,417.00$ | 129.55\% | 41,996.22 | 33,111.00 | 117.35\% | 38,855.76 |
| 1406 | 35,889.00 | 129.55\% | 46,494.20 | 35,552.00 | 117.35\% | 41,720.27 |
| 1407 | 40,702.00 | 129.55\% | 52,729.44 | 35,214.00 | 117.35\% | 41,323.63 |
| 1408 | 38,605.00 | 129.55\% | 50,012.78 | 30,646.00 | 117.35\% | 35,963.08 |
|  | 423,757.00 |  | 548,977.19 | 420,482.00 |  | 493,435.63 |

[^1]| (8) | (9) | (10) | (11) | (12) | (13) | (14) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Estimated Beer <br> And Tobacco Sales[(4) + (7)] | Average Product Mix To Taxable Sales** | Estimated Taxable Sales (Col. 8 / Col. 9) | $\begin{gathered} \text { Less 5\% } \\ \text { Allowance*** } \end{gathered}$ | Net Estimated Taxable Sales (Col. $10 \times$ Col. 11) | Less: Taxable Sales Reported | Additional Taxable Sales (Col. 12-Col. 13) |
| 80,908.00 | 64.7\% | 125,051.01 | 95\% | 118,798.46 | 40,142.00 | 78,656.46 |
| 90,586.28 | 64.7\% | 140,009.71 | 95\% | 133,009.22 | 30,756.00 | 102,253.22 |
| 87,833.26 | 64.7\% | 135,754.65 | 95\% | 128,966.92 | 35,234.00 | 93,732.92 |
| 87,907.70 | 64.7\% | 135,869.71 | 95\% | 129,076.22 | 33,805.00 | 95,271.22 |
| 84,785.62 | 64.7\% | 131,044.23 | 95\% | 124,492.02 | 33,769.00 | 90,723.02 |
| 76,975.94 | 64.7\% | 118,973.63 | 95\% | 113,024.95 | 31,905.00 | 81,119.95 |
| 86,837.86 | 64.7\% | 134,216.17 | 95\% | 127,505.36 | 38,918.00 | 88,587.36 |
| 97,482.77 | 64.7\% | 150,668.89 | 95\% | 143,135.45 | 39,059.00 | 104,076.45 |
| 80,851.98 | 64.7\% | 124,964.42 | 95\% | 118,716.20 | 41,503.00 | 77,213.20 |
| 88,214.47 | 64.7\% | 136,343.85 | 95\% | 129,526.66 | 39,636.00 | 89,890.66 |
| 94,053.07 | 64.7\% | 145,367.96 | 95\% | 138,099.56 | 42,935.00 | 95,164.56 |
| 85,975.86 | 64.7\% | 132,883.86 | 95\% | 126,239.67 | 44,506.00 | 81,733.67 |
| 1,042,412.82 |  | 1,611,148.10 |  | 1,530,590.69 | 452,168.00 | 1,078,422.69 |

Example \# 3 - Purchases Available for a few months Still in Business

- The taxpayer is still in business when the audit is generated.
- The taxpayer's purchase invoices are incomplete, but a few months' worth of complete purchases are available.
- Beer and tobacco purchases are the only purchases available for the entire audit period (HB 11).

The auditor obtains the taxpayer's beer and tobacco purchase information via the HB 11 information on the Audit Division's website to obtain the necessary purchase information for the audit period. A shelf test must be performed since the taxpayer is still in business. The auditor would examine the purchase records the taxpayer has on hand for completeness. If the auditor determines that the few months of records are mostly complete, a product mix must be calculated using the records available. To calculate the product mix, the auditor would apply the shelf test markup percentages for all product categories to their corresponding product purchase amounts to arrive at an estimated dollar value of taxable products for the months made available. A product mix for beer and tobacco will then be calculated based on this information. The estimated dollar amount of beer sales and of tobacco products sales for the audit period will be divided by the product mix percentage calculated. Again, remember to only include taxable items in your product mix percentage.

| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |

Notes:
*Markup for beer and tobacco was calculated per the shelf test findings. See Exam 1D.
**The product mix for beer and tobacco was calculated using taxpayer records. See Exam 1E.
***To allow 5\% for spoilage, pilferage, theft, etc.

| (8) | (9) | (10) | (11) | (12) | (13) | (14) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Estimated Beer <br> And Tobacco Sales[(4) + (7)] | Average Product Mix To Taxable Sales** | Estimated Taxable Sales (Col. 8 / Col. 9) | $\begin{gathered} \text { Less 5\% } \\ \text { Allowance*** } \end{gathered}$ | Net Estimated Taxable Sales (Col. 10 X Col. 11) | Less: Taxable Sales Reported | Additional Taxable Sales (Col. 12 - Col. 13) |
| 79,217.79 | 67.84\% | 116,771.50 | 95\% | 110,932.93 | 40,142.00 | 70,790.93 |
| 88,420.59 | 67.84\% | 130,336.95 | 95\% | 123,820.10 | 30,756.00 | 93,064.10 |
| 86,456.26 | 67.84\% | 127,441.43 | 95\% | 121,069.35 | 35,234.00 | 85,835.35 |
| 86,240.32 | 67.84\% | 127,123.12 | 95\% | 120,766.96 | 33,805.00 | 86,961.96 |
| 83,357.97 | 67.84\% | 122,874.36 | 95\% | 116,730.64 | 33,769.00 | 82,961.64 |
| 75,450.38 | 67.84\% | 111,218.13 | 95\% | 105,657.23 | 31,905.00 | 73,752.23 |
| 84,898.51 | 67.84\% | 125,145.21 | 95\% | 118,887.95 | 38,918.00 | 79,969.95 |
| 95,370.91 | 67.84\% | 140,582.12 | 95\% | 133,553.01 | 39,059.00 | 94,494.01 |
| 79,211.35 | 67.84\% | 116,762.01 | 95\% | 110,923.91 | 41,503.00 | 69,420.91 |
| 86,378.00 | 67.84\% | 127,326.06 | 95\% | 120,959.76 | 39,636.00 | 81,323.76 |
| 91,877.39 | 67.84\% | 135,432.47 | 95\% | 128,660.84 | 42,935.00 | 85,725.84 |
| 83,862.15 | 67.84\% | 123,617.56 | 95\% | 117,436.68 | 44,506.00 | 72,930.68 |
| 1,020,741.61 |  | 1,504,630.91 |  | 1,429,399.36 | 452,168.00 | 977,231.36 |

## Chapter VI <br> Convenience Store Audit Checklist

- Gross Sales
- Taxable Sales
- Selection of Test Periods
- Examination of Records
- Sampling/Estimation Issues

The following checklist has been developed as a guideline to be used in completing a convenience store audit. The items on this checklist are not all-inclusive, but are meant to serve as a guideline to the auditor.

## Gross Sales

- Do gross sales include any of the following?
» Sales tax collected
» Money order sales
» Gasoline sales
» Delivery income
» Sales of hunting or fishing licenses
» Sales of Lotto tickets
» Meat processing revenue
» Vending machine income
» Sales of amusement admissions
» Consignment or commission sales
» Snack bar or deli sales
- Have amounts paid by manufacturers to retailers for redeemed coupons been included in gross sales?
- Are separate sales records maintained for different departments (bakery, delicatessen, gasoline sales, meat, produce)?
" If so, can sales and purchases be segregated for the applications of the taxable percentage factor?
- Can the method of recording sales through vending machines be determined?
- How many cash registers are present?
- What is the product mix? Is there a higher ratio of taxable items than normal?


## Taxable Sales

- Determine method of reporting taxable sales
» Separate tax key on cash register
» Computer generated sales register
» Retail inventory method
» Gross profit method
» Purchase ratio method
» Estimated taxable percentage
» Other (describe)
- Review list of taxable items with taxpayer.
- Has the taxpayer failed to collect tax on any taxable items?
- Has the taxpayer collected tax on any nontaxable items?
- Are separate sales and purchase records maintained for the delicatessen department, lunch counter, meat department, etc.?
» If so, can an audit of these departments be performed separately and apart from the grocery operation?


## Selection of Test Periods

- Have there been any changes in the taxpayer's business operation during the audit period?
» Addition of beer and wine sales
" Addition of gas pumps
" Addition of "food-to-go" counter or delicatessen
» Addition of bakery department
» Addition of meat department
- Do sales fluctuate or increase at a fairly moderate rate?
- Is the reported percentage of taxable business relatively uniform throughout the audit period?
- Is there any noticeable effect of seasonal fluctuations?
- Are there any products carried for only certain seasons of the year?
» Christmas trees and ornaments
» Minnows and fishing supplies
" Hunting supplies
- Has the taxpayer used the same reporting procedures throughout the audit period?
- Are adequate records available to select test periods representative of all years and seasons of the year?
- Does the taxpayer agree that the test periods selected are the most representative of the business operation throughout the audit period?
- If there have been any significant changes in the business operations, have the test periods been selected to reflect these changes?


## Examination of Records

- Has a receipt been issued for all records removed from the taxpayer's premises?
- Has a "cut-off" date been established to include all purchases received/paid within the periods tested?
- Have all supply items been eliminated from gross purchases (grocery bags, deli supplies, etc.)?
- Have adjustments been made for purchase returns within the cut-off period?
- Have adjustments been made for self-consumed merchandise?
- Have adjustments been made for in-store transfers of merchandise?
- Are beginning and ending inventory figures available for the test period?
- Can inventories be identified by product or department?
- How were inventories priced? At retail? At cost?
- Are adjustments necessary for new stores or new departments establishing a base stock inventory?
- Have adjustments been made for any unusual losses such as theft, spoilage or fire losses that can be substantiated by police reports, insurance claims, or inventory studies?
- Have the necessary adjustments been made for customer purchases by food stamps/Lone Star Card?
- Does the taxpayer have any purchases or inventory on consignment?
- Check the method of handling sales made through vending machines and adjust purchases and/or sales accordingly.
- If the grocer is preparing sandwiches or hot food for immediate consumption, can amounts of the grocery purchases used in the preparation be obtained/reasonably estimated?
- Was the allowance made for theft, spoilage, and any errors inherent in the sampling/estimation technique?
- Were the audit procedures adequately discussed with the taxpayer?
- If an estimated audit is being performed, was the taxpayer adequately notified of the estimation procedures utilized?


## Sampling/Estimation Issues

Although an audit of a grocery/convenience store will rarely utilize true sampling procedures, an estimated audit will more than likely be performed. A Notification of Estimate will need to be issued if one or more of following conditions are met:

- The taxpayer refuses to provide all or part of the records requested by the auditor.
- The taxpayer does not have all or part of the records requested by the auditor.
- The auditor uses the purchase ratio method but projects the computed percentage into an estimated population.
- The auditor establishes markup percentages and product mix percentages based on the best information available because the taxpayer's records are incomplete or unreliable and the taxpayer is out of business.
- The auditor obtains third-party information because the taxpayer's records are incomplete or unreliable.

NOTE: Before estimating any audit, the auditor needs to follow the procedures for issuing a subpoena to obtain taxpayer records.

If a time period is utilized, the amounts obtained must be evaluated in the applicable section of the audit plan to ensure that the amounts are reasonably similar throughout the audit period. Any large variances must be explained. The averages of the sample base and of the population base must also be evaluated, and any large variances similarly explained.

For more information on sampling issues and procedures, please refer to the Audit Division's sampling manual.


[^0]:    Notes:
    *Markup for beer and tobacco was estimated using (Auditor documents how markup was derived for beer and tobacco)
    **The product mix for beer and tobacco was estimated using (Auditor documents how product mix was derived for beer and tobacco).
    ***To allow 5\% for spoilage, pilferage, theft, etc.

[^1]:    Notes:
    *Markup for beer and tobacco was calculated per the shelf test findings. See Exam 1D.
    **The product mix for beer and tobacco was estimated using (Auditor documents how product mix was derived for beer and tobacco).
    ***To allow $5 \%$ for spoilage, pilferage, theft, etc.

